

Helena Phillips-Robins
University of Cambridge
hcp34@cam.ac.uk

‘Cantavan tutti insieme ad una voce’: Singing and Community in the *Commedia*

Abstract: This essay argues that in the *Commedia* song becomes a key means of shaping and expressing modes of communal being. The singing of *In exitu Israel* that marks the souls’ arrival in *Purgatorio* and the performance of the *Gloria* that marks each soul’s departure create multiple communities that stretch across time and space to encompass the purgatorial souls, the angelic hosts and even the readers of the poem. I examine contemporary liturgical practices to suggest that the souls’ sung arrival into purgatory evokes a particular liturgical procession and that Dante’s treatment of word, music and movement offers the reader an opportunity to partake in the communal dynamics of *Purgatorio*.

Keywords: Dante, *Commedia*, *Purgatorio*, song, liturgy, community

Souls in the *Commedia* begin their purgatorial – and therefore paradisiacal – journey in song. In his first encounter with the saved, the pilgrim listens to the souls sing Psalm 113, *In exitu Israel de Aegypto*. The importance of this psalm as an Exodus text and of Exodus as an archetype for the shades’ journeys and for the narrative of the *Commedia* itself is well known.¹ But what about the souls’ *In exitu Israel* as song, as a lived, embodied experience of word, music and movement? What does it mean to enter a new life while singing?²

In this essay I explore the singing of *In exitu Israel* that marks the souls’ arrival in *Purgatorio* and the rendition of the *Gloria in excelsis Deo* that marks each soul’s departure, arguing that these songs help shape the communal dynamics of *Purgatorio*. Establishing a sense of community is a fundamental part of the work performed in *Purgatorio* and anticipates the radically communal indwelling of the souls in *Paradiso*. The opening performance of *In exitu Israel* and the closing performance of the *Gloria* create multiple communities that stretch across time and space to encompass the souls in *Purgatorio*, the angelic hosts in *Paradiso* and even the readers of the *Commedia*. I argue that singing and song are not simply part of the poem’s narrative backdrop, but a crucial means of creating and expressing the communal relationships in and through which the souls journey towards God.³

I begin by examining liturgical practices of Dante’s Florence to argue that the performance of *In exitu Israel* in *Purgatorio* II recalls a specific moment in the liturgy – the procession held at Easter Sunday Vespers. The liturgical singing of the souls offers the reader a chance to enter the communal dynamics of *Purgatorio*, to share in the shades’ words and sense of movement. Recently scholars have begun to reveal the richness and complexity of, in Matthew Treherne’s phrase, Dante’s ‘liturgical imagination’.⁴ Arguing for the need to study liturgy in the *Commedia*, Ronald Martinez reminds us that liturgy was ‘the most widely shared body of coordinated texts, symbols, objects, gestures, actions, and practices in all of medieval culture’.⁵ Treherne draws on modern liturgical theorists to demonstrate that far from being mere mechanical ritual, liturgy can be understood as a means of manifesting and incarnating the relationships between human beings and God. Liturgical performance can offer ways of organising time and space, language and movement to express and

embody the conditions in which man can know God.⁶ In as far as my essay explores Dante's liturgies, I focus on the temporalities and communities contained in and created by liturgy and the opportunities these afford the reader.

Liturgy encompassed many models and ways of negotiating time. Liturgical performances were understood as re-enacting past events - re-creating them in the present moment - as well as anticipating events that were to come. In the chants, in the sacraments, in the bodies of those participating in the liturgy, past, present and future are made to mystically converge in, to use Margot Fassler's phrase, a sense of 'all time'. In a liturgical framework, time was perceived as both linear and cyclical, as rituals were repeated day by day, season by season, re-creating historical events in the moment of performance and gathering past, present and future together into the here and now of worship.⁷

At the opening of *Purgatorio* II a multitude of souls speed towards purgatory, chanting a psalm in unison and filling the boat in which they travel with song:

e quei sen venne a riva
con un vasello snelletto e leggero,
tanto che l'acqua nulla ne 'nghiottiva.
Da poppa stava il celestial nocchiero,
tal che pareo beato per iscripto;
e più di cento spirti entro sediero.
'*In exitu Isräel de Aegypto*'
cantavan tutti insieme ad una voce
con quanto di quel salmo è poscia scripto.
Poi fece il segno lor di santa croce;
ond' ei si gittar tutti in su la spiaggia:
ed el sen gi, come venne, veloce. (*Purg.*, II. 40-51)⁸

Dunstan Tucker demonstrated that the living out of the Exodus in the Easter liturgy was a key model for Dante's use of the Exodus, both in *Purgatorio* II and in the *Commedia* as a whole.⁹ Albert Wingell observed that Psalm 113, *In exitu Israel de Aegypto*, was sung at Vespers every Sunday, including Easter Day.¹⁰ I would like to build on this insight into Psalm 113 as part of the liturgy of Vespers to suggest that the souls' arrival in purgatory evokes a procession, specifically the procession performed at Vespers on Easter Sunday.

Sung at evening, the Office of Vespers began with a versicle and then a series of five psalms and continued with a short reading, a responsory, a hymn, and a dialogue or set of preces and finished with the Magnificat and a collect. At secular (non-monastic) Sunday Vespers, Psalms 109 to 113 were sung, the final one being, therefore, *In exitu Israel de Aegypto*. On Easter Sunday, however, there were several changes: various elements from Mass were incorporated into Vespers, only three psalms were sung at the start of the service and a procession was added near the end.¹¹

For more specific details on the performance of Vespers we can turn to ordinal books (*libri ordinarii*), texts which give instructions on how to perform the Mass and Office throughout the year.¹² Two ordinals survive from the Cathedral of Santa Reparata in Florence: the more extensive of the two, known as the *Ritus in ecclesia servandi*, was written between 1173-1205; the second, known as the *Mores et consuetudines canonice Florentine*, was compiled around 1230. Marginal additions in both manuscripts suggest that they were used throughout the thirteenth century. Together they give a vivid picture of liturgical practices, including the performance of music and processions, in Dante's Florence. An edition of the *Mores* was published in the eighteenth century, but the *Ritus* only became widely available when Franklin

Toker published the *editio princeps* in 2009.¹³ Scholars have recently demonstrated the richness of these texts as windows onto the civic, liturgical and musical life of twelfth and thirteenth-century Florence, but they have as yet been little touched in Dante studies.¹⁴

In the *Ritus* we find instructions for the performance of Easter Sunday Vespers. The crucial detail for our purposes is that Psalm 113 – *In exitu Israel* – is moved to the end of the service to be sung in a procession from the Cathedral to the Baptistery:

Finita oratione, facimus processionem cum cruce et cereo benedicto et incenso ante crucifixum, imposita a cantore ant. *Crucifixum in carne*, que dum cantatur, incensantur crux et altare. [...] Qua finita, procedimus in ecclesiam sancti Johannis ad fontem cum ant. *Stetit angelus* et cereo et cruce tantum. Finita ant. *Stetit angelus*, imponatur ant. *Venite et videte locum* super psalmos *Laudate pueri dominum* et *In exitu Israel*, quibus dictis, repetitur ant. (lines 1638-43, ant. = antiphona)

[After the collect we form a procession, with the cross, holy candles and incense, in front of the crucifix. The antiphon *Crucifixum in carne* is begun by the cantor and while it is sung the altar and crucifix are censed. [...] After this we process to the church of St John, to the font, with cross and candles only, while the antiphon *Stetit angelus* is sung. After the antiphon *Stetit angelus*, let the antiphon *Venite et videte locum* be begun for the psalms *Laudate pueri dominum* and *In exitu Israel*, and once these psalms have been sung the antiphon is repeated.]

The altar and crucifix are censed and then the procession – with cross and candles – sets out for the Baptistery, to the accompaniment of the Easter chant, *Stetit angelus*, the antiphon that precedes Psalms 112 and 113 and then the psalms themselves. The ordinal continues with instructions for the conclusion of the service: a salutation, collect and dismissal.¹⁵ If the *Ritus* was used throughout the thirteenth century, then every Easter Sunday in Dante's Florence – for all participating in or witnessing the services of the Cathedral – Psalm 113 became a processional psalm, closely linked to the journey from Cathedral to Baptistery.¹⁶

Similar practices are described in other contemporary ordinal books. An early thirteenth-century ordinal from the Duomo in Siena draws attention to the participation of the people in the procession: 'Sacerdos cum Pluviali turificat Altaria, super et infra, & datur Clero, et Populo, & idem Sacerdos cum Pluviali vadit ad fontes cum aliis' ['the priest, wearing a cope, censes the altar and the clergy and people, and the same priest, wearing a cope, goes to the font with the others'].¹⁷ The Sienese ordinal prescribes different antiphons and prayers to those specified in the Florentine *Ritus*, but the overall structure of Easter Sunday Vespers is the same. As regards Psalm 113 and the procession, the practice is like that of Santa Reparata: after the Magnificat and prayers before the cross, a procession (with cross and candles) goes to the Baptistery, accompanied by an antiphon, and on arrival at the font Psalms 112 and 113 are sung.¹⁸ In contrast to the Easter Vespers in the Florentine *Ritus*, the Sienese service has a return procession to the Cathedral where the office ends.

At Easter Sunday Vespers at the cathedral in Pistoia, it is clear that *In exitu Israel* was sung during the procession itself. Once the Magnificat had been chanted the cantor would begin the antiphon for Psalm 113:

Cantor incipit antiphonam *Et respicientes* et incipitur psalmus *In exitu Israel*. Et ita processionaliter, cruce preeunte, cantando predictum psalmum, imus ad fontes. Ibiq[ue], terminato psalmo, succinitur predicta antiphona.¹⁹

[The cantor begins the antiphon *Et respicientes* and then the psalm *In exitu Israel* is begun. And so, with the cross leading the way, we process to the font, singing the

aforementioned psalm. And there, once the psalm is finished, the aforementioned antiphon is sung in simple polyphony.]

The service ended with a second rendition of the Magnificat, a collect and the dismissal, *Benedicamus Domino*.²⁰

Moving out of Tuscany, we find similar instructions for Easter Sunday Vespers. The thirteenth-century ordinal from the cathedral of Padua, for example, records that Psalm 113 was to be sung *en route* to the font:

Qua finita ordinata est processio cum cereis et cum cruce et turribulo, et tunc cantor incipit ANT *Alleluia*, et chorus descendit ad fontem cantando duos psalmos, scilicet *Laudate pueri* et *In exitu Israel*.²¹

[After this a procession is formed, with candles, cross and thurible, and then the cantor begins the antiphon *Alleluia* and then the choir processes down to the font singing the two psalms, namely, *Laudate pueri* and *In exitu Israel*.]

The cantor intones the antiphon and the choir (later described as a *chorus clericorum*) sing the psalms as they proceed to the Baptistry.

The greatest liturgical *summa* of the Middle Ages, William Durand's *Rationale divinorum officiorum* (circulating from c. 1292), includes an exposition of the Office of Vespers for Easter Sunday and Easter Week. This description contains many of the elements we have found in individual ordinals. A procession is held - in which, Durand notes, the people should participate - and as it arrives at the font Psalms 112 and 113 are sung.²²

These devotional practices resonate with the drama of *Purgatorio* II. As church processions were led by a crucifer and acolytes ('cum cruce et cereo benedicto et incenso', 'cruce preeunte', 'processio cum cereis et cum cruce et turribulo'), so the souls in *Purgatorio* II are heralded by an angel who appears first as a shining light and then in the shape of a cross:

cotal m'apparve, s'io ancor lo veggia,
un lume per lo mar venir sì ratto,

[...]

Poi d'ogne lato ad esso m'appario
un non sapeva che bianco, e di sotto

a poco a poco un altro a lui uscìo. (*Purg.*, II. 16-17, 22-24)

The angel bears in himself both light and cross; he is a fiery *lume* from which extend - one to the left, one to the right and one below - three white shapes. He is both crucifer and acolyte for the procession.

Processions moved in and around their home church and also from one church to another. The shades in *Purgatorio* II proceed from the Church Militant on earth to the Church Suffering in purgatory. Their boat journey ends with a liturgical blessing as the angel, now in the role of a priest, dismisses the souls by making the sign of the cross ('fece il segno lor di santa croce', 49). Music was a fundamental part of processions and the souls advance while singing a psalm that, every Easter Sunday, became a processional psalm - sung during or at the conclusion of a procession from Cathedral to Baptistry. The action of *Purgatorio* II, of course, occurs on Easter Sunday morning.

Support for reading the souls' arrival in purgatory as a version of an Easter procession can be found in Durand's *Rationale*, in which the Vespers procession is linked to the Israelites' crossing of the Red Sea:

Sane, descendimus processionaliter ad fontes cum cereo per totam ebdomadam cantantes canticum exultationis, et populus sequitur, uidelicet uiri per se et mulieres per se, quod fit in memoriam eius quod Hebrei, Pharaone et suis in Mari Rubro

submersis, fecerunt qui, in gratiarum actiones de submersione hostium, per totam ebdomadam redibant ad mare, uiri per se et mulieres per se, cantantes canticum illud Moysi: *Cantemus Domino* etc. Siquidem hostes nostri sunt demones, Mare Rubrum baptismus in quo submerguntur omnes hostes, id est uitia et peccata et demones.

(*Rationale*, VI, 89, 10)

[Certainly, each day in [Easter] week we process with candles to the font singing a song of exultation and the people follow, that is, the men all together and the women all together. This is done in remembrance of that which the Israelites did after Pharaoh and his men had been drowned in the Red Sea. Each day in that week the Israelites, in thanksgiving for the drowning of their enemies, went back to the sea, the men all together and the women all together, singing that song of Moses: *Cantemus Domino* etc. So our enemies are demons, and our Red Sea is the baptism in which all our enemies, namely vices and sins and demons, are drowned.]

The procession is performed in commemoration - 'in memoriam' - of the crossing of the Red Sea. The Israelites went down to the sea 'cantantes canticum', as the participants in the Vespers liturgy go down to the Baptistry in song. Durand establishes a figural relationship between the Old Testament event and the liturgical ceremony: the Israelites' enemies were drowned in the Red Sea, as our enemies - our sins - are drowned in the Red Sea of our baptism. Commemoration, therefore, does not only involve a bringing to mind, but a re-enactment of past events. In their singing and in their movement the participants re-create the historical event and past and present converge in the experience of liturgical performance.²³ I shall return later to the layering of temporalities, noting for now that if the Easter Vespers procession re-enacts the Exodus crossing of the Red Sea, then the purgatorial souls, in their own Exodus crossing of a different sea, may in turn evoke a liturgical procession.²⁴

During their stay in *Purgatorio* the souls gradually learn what it means to become part of a community.²⁵ In stark contrast to the infernal souls, each fixed in his proud isolation, the purgatorial shades learn to treat one other as brothers and sisters, *conservi* of God: 'conservo sono / teco e con li altri ad una podestate' (*Purg.*, XIX. 134-35). Numerous practices serve to train the souls and direct them into a communal existence: singing and speaking together (the perfect unison achieved by the wrathful, for example, as they repeat their chant over and over again: 'pur *Agnus Dei* eran le loro essordia; / una parola in tutte era e un modo, / sì che pareva tra esse ogne concordia', XVI. 19-21); praying for each other and for those on earth (the collective *Pater noster* of the proud, for instance, ending with intercession for the living: 'quest' ultima preghiera, signor caro, / già non si fa per noi, che non bisogna, / ma per color che dietro a noi restaro', XI. 22-24); physically upholding each other (as do the envious: 'l'un sofferia l'altro con la spalla', XIII. 59); and moving in concert one with another (the lustful, for example, pausing to share a greeting: 'li veggio d'ogne parte farsi presta / ciasun' ombra e basciarsi una con una / sanza restar, contente a brieve festa', XXVI. 31-33). This gradually acquired shared existence prepares the shades for the profoundly communal dynamics of *Paradiso*, where the souls are utterly open to each other as they exist in and through God. It is a state of communality, of unity in diversity, that mirrors the indwelling of the Trinity and that is evoked in a series of active neologisms: *indiarsi* (IV. 28), *inluiarsi* (IX. 73), *inmiarsi* (IX. 81), *inleiarsi* (XXII. 127).²⁶

It is in *Purgatorio* II that the souls begin their communal endeavours. The angel pilots them across the sea, effecting a collective movement for all the shades in the boat and giving them a taste of the communality they will later have to work to achieve. In their singing, however, these newcomers do have to exert themselves in

shared effort. They join together in song, their attentive coordination highlighted as they blend their many voices into one: ‘cantavan tutti insieme ad una voce’ (II. 47).²⁷

Although only the first line is written into the text of the poem, Dante makes clear that the psalm is sung in its entirety:

‘*In exitu Israël de Aegypto*’

cantavan tutti insieme ad una voce

con quanto di quel salmo è poscia scripto.

Poi fece il segno lor di santa croce;

ond’ ei si gittar tutti in su la spiaggia:

ed el sen gî, come venne, veloce. (*Purg.*, II. 46-51)

Line 48 – ‘con quanto di quel salmo è poscia scripto’ – is an implicit invitation to call to mind the rest of the psalm. What happens if we pause our reading of the canto to recite, sing, or open a Bible and read the whole of the psalm? What happens to our experience as readers if we respond to Dante’s invitation and insert our own singing of Psalm 113 into the canto?

The shades are blessed and set foot in purgatory as soon as they have finished the psalm. If we perform *In exitu Israel* and then return to the *Commedia* we come – in our reading - to the arrival in purgatory with the same words on our lips as do the souls. We utter the concluding words of the psalm and then read the description of the souls’ arrival (‘poi fece il segno lor di santa croce...’), in a move that is analogous to the shades singing the final verses of the psalm and then receiving the angelic dismissal.

We saw earlier how liturgy was understood as bringing together multiple levels of time, as making past, present and future converge in the cycles of liturgical performance. With regard to Easter Sunday Vespers, we saw that liturgical commentators interpreted the procession as a commemoration and re-creation of the crossing of the Red Sea. The procession re-enacts the events of the crossing, now experienced in the light of the Resurrection. A figural relationship is established between moments separated in linear time and past and present converge in the moment of liturgical performance. Participants in the procession are brought into community across time and space with those who preceded them in the faith.

These conceptions provide not a direct model, but a helpful way of exploring the possibilities offered to the reader in *Purgatorio* II. Dante opens a space in which we can sing *In exitu Israel* and, crucially, does so in such a way that the angelic benediction immediately follows our performance of the concluding verses, just as it does for the singing of the souls. Our rendition of the psalm is layered over that of the shades and the distance between the two is elided. We re-perform their words - and the timing of those words - and are thus drawn into a community that stretches beyond the boundaries of the poem.

The singing of the psalm scans the souls’ voyage across the sea and the liturgical associations of their journey recall lived processions from Cathedral to Baptistery. The reader thus not only has the chance to sing the words of *In exitu Israel* but, through memory of her own experiences, to relate to, enact, and experience corporeally the movement traced by the psalm.

We could also consider this corporeal participation in the souls’ journey in terms offered by cognitive literary theory. In an article that brings together neuroscientific research and literary theory, Vittorio Gallese and Hannah Wojciehowski explain the concept of ‘embodied simulation’. When we watch, read of or even imagine someone performing a particular action or gesture, the same cortical regions of our brain are activated as would be if we were actually performing the

action or gesture ourselves. Embodied simulation is a direct, pre-reflective response that offers a corporeal means of engaging with the actions, gestures and feelings of others.²⁸ In these terms, the liturgical associations of the *Purgatorio* II drama could trigger embodied simulation in the reader. If the singing of the psalm evokes a familiar processional mode and marks out the passage from Duomo to Baptistry, then by reciting the psalm the reader may perform her own simulated journey.

The processional associations of the souls' voyage evoke a type of movement highly familiar to Dante's contemporary readers, a form of movement that is by definition collective. You cannot, after all, have a procession of one. Processions are by nature a shared experience and each participant must be attentive to the rhythms, pace and direction of those around her. She must adapt her movements to those of her fellow participants, allowing the bearing and motion of others to refine her own.²⁹ In *Purgatorio* II, the souls themselves do not yet have to move in concert with one another as their collective movement is effected for them by the angel. The reader, however, may recall the attentive shared motion of past processions. At the beginning of the shades' journey towards God, a journey that will lead them into an ever more profoundly communal mode of being, the reader has the opportunity not only to behold but also to re-experience a form of communal relationship.

Processions enact rites of passage, marking out transitions from one space or condition to another. In Edward Muir's phrase, they are 'state[s] of prolonged liminality'.³⁰ The Easter Vespers procession in particular is strongly associated with transition, new life and new beginnings. It is a journey to the font – a place of passage, entrance and renewal – made on the day of Christ's Resurrection. Durand and canon Oderigo (compiler of the Sienese ordinal), for example, both foreground the presence of the newly baptized in the procession.³¹

We do not, of course, need to link the souls' voyage with the Easter Sunday Vespers procession to appreciate the importance of Resurrection and renewal at this point in the *Commedia*. The fact that it is Easter Day, that the souls are beginning their new lives, that they sing a psalm of Exodus, that the pilgrim has just emerged from hell and undergone a rite of cleansing are only some of the elements that situate the souls' passage in the context of resurrection and renewal. What I suggest is that by offering the reader the chance to sing the psalm and to situate it as part of a specific liturgical performance, Dante gives her the possibility of experiencing her own process of transition. Once she has emerged from the depths of hell and as she sets out on the new *cantica*, the reader is offered a moment of renewal, an opening in the text in which she can participate in the song and movement of passage and rebirth.

At the beginning of *Paradiso* Dante foregrounds the movement of his readers from one canticle to another. Rewriting the metaphor of the sea voyage used in *Purgatorio* I, Dante proclaims the radical newness of *Paradiso* and warns all those who approach the final *cantica*:

O voi che siete in piccioletta barca,
desiderosi d'ascoltar, seguiti
dietro al mio legno che cantando varca,
tornate a riveder li vostri liti:
non vi mettete in pelago, ché forse,
perdendo me, rimarreste smarriti.
L'acqua ch'io prendo già mai non si corse;
Minerva spira, e conducemi Appollo,
e nove Muse mi dimostran l'Orse.
Voialtri pochi che drizzaste il collo

per tempo al pan de li angeli, del quale
vivesi qui ma non sen vien satollo,
metter potete ben per l'alto sale
vostro navigio, servando mio solco
dinanzi a l'acqua che ritorna equale. (*Par.*, II. 1-15)

Dante distinguishes between types of reader: those who are able to confront the difficulties and dangers of the new canticle and those who are not. Robin Kirkpatrick argues that Dante here invites the reader to examine herself, to ask what sort of reader she is and thus to decide whether or not she should venture into *Paradiso*. Anna Maria Chiavacci Leonardi also emphasizes the need for the reader to make a choice, though she frames the issue differently. The reader can choose whether or not to continue through *Paradiso*, but if she knows she lacks the necessary understanding, she must go and deepen her knowledge before returning to the *Commedia*.³² Embarking on *Paradiso* is an active undertaking and is figured as a journey in the wake of a ship. More precisely, it is a journey in the wake of a singing ship: 'dietro al mio legno che cantando varca'. The boat that crosses the waters in *Purgatorio* II is not the only singing vessel in the *Commedia*.³³

The ships of *Purgatorio* II and *Paradiso* II are aligned on multiple levels. They are both filled with song, whether the chanting of the souls or the singing through poetry; they both sail into view in the second canto of their respective canticles; and they are linked verbally, both being described as a *legno* - the 'più lieve legno', as Charon labels the purgatorial ship (*Inf.*, III. 93), and the 'legno che cantando varca' of *Paradiso* II.³⁴ They are, furthermore, both part of fundamental moments of transition. In *Purgatorio* II the souls make their passage from earth to purgatory, while in *Paradiso* II the reader journeys from the poetics of *Purgatorio* to the new poetics of *Paradiso*.

If the souls must experience a time of transition between earth and purgatory, a time in which they first experience an example of the communal endeavour that will characterize their whole stay in *Purgatorio*, and if the pilgrim must also make his passage from *Inferno* to *Purgatorio*, a passage in which he must be cleansed and then girded with a reed of humility (*Purg.*, I. 121-36), a passage in which he seeks refreshment and consolation after the physical and moral travail of hell (*Purg.*, II. 106-11), then should not the reader also experience a time of transition as she moves from *Inferno* to *Purgatorio*? In *Paradiso* II a metaphorical singing vessel leads the way; in *Purgatorio* II a different singing ship provides a space in which we can make the transition from one canticle to the next. The move from the poetics of *Inferno* to those of *Purgatorio* may not be as arduous as the move into *Paradiso*, but we must still be made ready for the new, communal dynamics of *Purgatorio*. We are given a space in which to perform the psalm, to arrive at the souls' blessing with the same words on our lips, and to experience corporeally the shades' processional movement.

Dante does not oblige us to sing the souls' psalm. We can choose how to respond to the presence of the song's *incipit* and subsequent 'con quanto di quel salmo è poscia scripto'. The words *In exitu Israël de Aegypto* may trigger the second half of the verse, we may perform the psalm, or we may not. As in *Paradiso* II, where Dante distinguishes different types of reader, so in *Purgatorio* II he gives different opportunities to different kinds of reader. The liturgical singing of Psalm 113 opens a space in which the reader may – to her own degree – share in the souls' song and movement, participating in the new communal dynamics of *Purgatorio* and making the transition from one *cantica* to the next.³⁵

To reach Mount Purgatory the souls cross a vast expanse of sea, the uninhabited, uncharted ocean of the Southern hemisphere. The other person who had tried to journey across that sea was, of course, Ulysses. In his retelling of the voyage Ulysses foregrounds the unknown; lying beyond the pillars of Hercules, this ocean is a space into which man has not and should not venture. For Ulysses it is a realm to be conquered, a space in which to prove his human greatness, a space to master through his own unaided exertions (*Inf.*, XXVI. 106-20). He desires *virtute e canoscenza*, yet seeks them in a world devoid of people and thus devoid of the relationships in which virtue can thrive. He fails to understand, Vittorio Montemaggi argues, that virtue and knowledge flourish in communal contexts and so cannot be found in a *mondo senza gente*.³⁶

In the opening of *Purgatorio* we encounter the same space that cannot be mastered by human effort: ‘Venimmo poi in sul lito deserto, / che mai non vide navicar sue acque / omo, che di tornar sia poscia esperto’ (*Purg.*, I. 130-32, in the well-known echo of *Inf.*, XXVI). Yet unlike Ulysses, the purgatorial souls cross the ocean as a community, ferried by the angel and attentive to each other as they join their voices in song. The liturgical, processional associations of their voyage, moreover, bring a sense of a lived, communal space into this otherwise unknown realm. Evoked by and embedded in their crossing is a place familiar and intimate to Dante’s contemporary readers, the walk from one’s local cathedral to the baptistery. As well as drawing the shades into community with one another, their liturgical song has the power to shape communal space, to bring a known, shared dimension to the very realm through which they pass.³⁷

The souls remain in the boat for as long as it takes to finish singing the psalm and then the end of the song brings the voyage to a close. Song regulates the moment of arrival and subsequent departure: as soon as the psalm is concluded the shades are blessed, they disembark and the angel begins his return journey.³⁸ Because song scans their processional movement, the final verses of Psalm 113 are sung moments before the souls set foot on land. These verses run:

The dead shall not praise thee, O Lord: nor any of them that go down to hell.
But we that live bless the Lord: from this time now and forever. (Ps. 113. 25-26)³⁹
If the reader takes the time to recite the psalm she will be made more deeply aware of the words with which the souls arrive in purgatory. They arrive not with words of penitence, but with words of praise on their lips.⁴⁰

It is not until *Purgatorio* V that we hear a song of penance. The souls who died violent deaths walk along the shore singing:

E ’ntanto per la costa di traverso
venivan genti innanzi a noi un poco,
cantando ‘Miserere’ a verso a verso. (*Purg.*, V. 22-24)

They chant the penitential psalm *par excellence*, Psalm 50. The first sacred chant that the pilgrim hears on land is the ultimate song of penance, but the song through which the souls make their transition to purgatory is one of praise.

The end of each soul’s time in *Purgatorio* is also marked by doxology. At the moment in which the soul becomes ready to ‘mutar convento’ (*Purg.*, XXI. 62), to move from purgatory through Eden to paradise, the other shades burst out, *Gloria in excelsis Deo*.⁴¹ Song shaped the souls’ arrival in *Purgatorio* and song – or rather, as we shall see, a complex layering of *grido* and *canto* – shapes each soul’s departure.

While the pilgrim is advancing round the fifth terrace, the mountain suddenly shakes and a great shout arises from every soul in purgatory:

Poi cominciò da tutte parti un grido

tal, che 'l maestro inverso me si feo,
dicendo: "Non dubbiar, mentr' io ti guido".

'*Gloria in excelsis*' tutti 'Deo'
dicean, per quel ch'io da' vicin compresi,
onde intender lo grido si poteo.

No' istavamo immobili e sospesi
come i pastor che prima udir quel canto,
fin che 'l tremar cessò ed el compiési. (*Purg.*, XX. 133-41)

The purgatorial *Gloria* recalls the very first singing of the *Gloria*, the wondrous rendition to the shepherds at the Nativity.⁴² The singing at Bethlehem and the shouting on the mountain in the year 1300 are two moments separated in time, a linear succession of events signalled by the temporal marker *prima*. Yet also present is a sense of cyclical time. The souls' *Gloria* puts the pilgrim and Virgil in the same physical, emotional and spiritual state as the angels' *Gloria* did for the shepherds at the Nativity. They are 'immobili e sospesi', just as Dante tells us the shepherds were when they heard those words sung in the fields at Bethlehem. Their experience is re-created in the new listeners.

Virgil and the pilgrim share in the experience of the shepherds, and the souls - as the temporal distance between the two *Glorias* is further collapsed - briefly share in the devotion of the angels. Dante introduced the mountainquake and the *Gloria* as a *tremar* and a *grido*: 'quand' io senti' [...] tremar lo monte [...] poi cominciò da tutte parti un grido' (XX. 127-8, 133). But he concludes the description by pairing *tremar* with the pronoun *el*:

No' istavamo immobili e sospesi
come i pastor che prima udir quel canto,
fin che 'l tremar cessò ed el compiési. (XX. 139-41)

The phrase 'el compiési' refers to the completion of the souls' *Gloria*, but does so by referring to the angelic song. The noun that directly precedes 'el', and which the pronoun replaces, is 'quel canto' – the hymn sung to the Bethlehem shepherds. The ending of the purgatorial *Gloria* is evoked as the ending of the very first singing of the *Gloria*. The pronoun 'el' encompasses the *Gloria* both as purgatorial *grido* and as angelic *canto*. As in medieval understandings of liturgy where past, present and future are mystically made to co-exist in the 'all time' of liturgical performance, so here the distance between the two events is elided as both somehow co-exist in the same moment. It is not that the souls' *Gloria* is transformed into the angels' song, but nor does it remain fully distinct from it. The shades' *Gloria* affects the listeners in the same way as did the angels' and the moment in which it finishes is described as the moment in which the angelic song ends.

The souls perform their *Gloria* in thanksgiving for the liberation of another shade, in this case, Statius. We learn that it is not because of any external sign that the soul realises he is cleansed and free, but because he senses it within himself:

De la mondizia sol voler fa prova,
che, tutto libero a mutar convento,
l'alma sorprende, e di voler le giova. (*Purg.*, XXI. 61-63)

It is a deeply personal experience, as Statius's emphatic first person verb further highlights: 'sentii / libera volontà di miglior soglia' (*Purg.*, XXI. 68-69). Yet it is also one in which every soul on the mountain to some degree shares. By praising God for Statius's newfound freedom the other shades participate in his liberation. Their liturgical shout of praise allows them to be in communion with him, even as he moves from the penitential community to a new *convento*, and they remain behind.

In her work on liturgy Catherine Pickstock offers an insight that is particularly helpful here. She writes that liturgy offers a means of mediating the private and the public, allowing a ‘co-dwelling’ of the individual and the community: [T]he liturgical relativises the everyday without denying its value. Personal joys are not allowed to become over-inflated because they are placed within the context of collective enjoyment and are seen as but specific manifestations of a continuous collective celebration. Inversely, personal sorrows are shared with others and are viewed in the context of cosmic patterns which include such tragic eventualities. [...] By contrast, a modern individual may alternate between seeking refuge from public misery in private delight, or escaping personal sorrow through absorption in the impersonal world of the media. But in neither case do the public and the private mediate each other in a liturgical fashion [...]. People cannot readily live with themselves and in public at the same time. But this co-dwelling is exactly what liturgy renders possible.⁴³

In *Purgatorio* XX there is a co-dwelling of public and private that moves beyond the everyday joys and sorrows of this world. The moment of liberation both is and is not an individual experience. Each soul arrives at his freedom in his own time and becomes aware of it in a moment of inner realization, yet every soul in *Purgatorio* rejoices with him and praises God for his liberation. The mountain quakes and the souls exult in the very moment in which the shade perceives his new freedom within himself:

Tremaci quando alcuna anima monda
sentesi, sì che surga o che si mova
per salir sù; e tal grido seconda. (*Purg.*, XXI. 58-60)

The personal experience of liberation becomes a chance for the whole mountainside to join with each other and with the freed soul. The experience of a single soul becomes the occasion to generate community. Through liturgy, those shades who are part way through their purgation are briefly joined in community with one who is about to ascend to heaven.

In *Purgatorio* XXI, the souls’ *Gloria* is described as a *congaudere*:

Omai veggio la rete
che qui vi’ mpiglia e come si scalappia,
perché ci trema e di che congaudete. (*Purg.*, XXI. 76-78)

Congaudere - a hapax in the *Commedia* - is, as commentators have observed, drawn from a passage in St Paul’s first letter to the Corinthians.⁴⁴ In the twelfth chapter of that epistle Paul describes the diversity in unity of the Christian people. The faithful make up the mystical body of Christ; they are all individual members who together form the one body. No single member can survive by himself but is in organic unity with the others in Christ:

For as the body is one, and hath many members; and all the members of the body, whereas they are many, yet are one body, so also is Christ. [...] Now you are the body of Christ. (I Corinthians, 12. 12, 27)

In the middle of this discussion we find Paul’s *congaudere*:

Et si quid patitur unum membrum, compatiuntur omnia membra: sive gloriatur unum membrum, congaudent omnia membra.

And if one member suffer any thing, all the members suffer with it; or if one member glory, all the members rejoice with it. (I Corinthians, 12. 26)

The co-suffering and co-rejoicing of the members are manifestations of the unity of the body of Christ. In *Purgatorio* XX the souls’ *congaudere* - their *grido-canto* - both manifests and creates community, as the shades rejoice in the freedom of a single soul

and are brought to share, if only momentarily, in the devotion of the angels. The singing of *In exitu Israel* and of the *Gloria* shape multiple communities across time and space, allowing for types of communal being that encompass the souls in purgatory, the angelic hosts and even the readers of Dante's poem.

I would like to thank Heather Webb and the anonymous readers at *Italian Studies* for their very helpful comments on earlier drafts of this article.

¹ See Dunstan J. Tucker, 'In exitu Israel de Aegypto: The Divine Comedy in the Light of the Easter Liturgy', *American Benedictine Review*, 11 (1960), 43-61; Charles S. Singleton, 'In exitu Israel de Aegypto', *Annual Report of the Dante Society*, 78 (1960), 1-24; Peter Armour, 'The Theme of Exodus in the First Two Cantos of the *Purgatorio*', in *Dante Soundings: Eight Literary and Historical Essays*, ed. by David Nolan (Dublin: Irish Academic Press, 1981), pp. 59-99; *The Divine Comedy of Dante Alighieri*, ed. by Robert M. Durling and Ronald L. Martinez, 3 vols (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1996-2011), II, 12-15.

² Amilcare A. Iannucci, 'Musica e ordine nella *Divina Commedia* (*Purgatorio* II)', in *Studi americani su Dante*, ed. by Gian Carlo Alessio and Robert Hollander (Milan: Angeli, 1989), pp. 87-111, explores *In exitu Israel* as song and contrasts it with the other musical performance in *Purgatorio* II, Casella's singing of *Amor che ne la mente mi ragiona*. While Iannucci focuses on the contrast between the two songs and contextualizes them in the Boethian understanding of the tripartite division of *musica*, my essay focuses on *In exitu Israel* as liturgical song and examines it (the first song in *Purgatorio*) together with the singing that ends each soul's purgatorial journey.

³ On the complexities of music, including song, in the *Commedia*, see Francesco Ciabattini, *Dante's Journey to Polyphony* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2010); Erminia Ardissino, 'I canti liturgici nel *Purgatorio* dantesco', *Dante Studies*, 108 (1990), 39-65; Iannucci, 'Musica e ordine', pp. 87-111; Nino Pirrotta, 'Dante *Musicus*: Gothicism, Scholasticism, and Music', *Speculum*, 43 (1968), 245-57; Lukas Richter, 'Dante e la musica del suo tempo', in *La musica nel tempo di Dante*, ed. by Luigi Pestalozza (Milan: Unicopli, 1988), pp. 55-112; Edoardo Sanguineti, 'Canzone sacra e Canzone profana', in *ibid.*, pp. 206-21; John Stevens, 'Dante and Music', *Italian Studies*, 23 (1968), 1-18.

⁴ Matthew Treherne, 'La *Commedia* di Dante e l'immaginario liturgico', in *Pregheiera e liturgia nella 'Commedia': Atti del Convegno internazionale di Studi, Ravenna, 12 novembre 2011*, ed. by Giuseppe Ledda (Ravenna: Centro dantesca dei Frati minori conventuali, 2013), pp. 11-30. On liturgy in the *Commedia*, see also Matthew Treherne, 'Liturgical Personhood: Creation, Penitence, and Praise in the *Commedia*', in *Dante's 'Commedia': Theology as Poetry*, ed. by Vittorio Montemaggi and Matthew Treherne (Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 2010), pp. 131-60; Ronald L. Martinez, 'The Poetics of Advent Liturgies: Dante's *Vita Nova* and *Purgatorio*', in *Le culture di Dante: Studi in onore di Robert Hollander*, ed. by Michelangelo Picone, Theodore J. Cachey Jr and Margherita Mesirca (Florence: Cesati, 2004), pp. 271-304; Ronald L. Martinez, 'Dante and the Poem of the Liturgy', in *Reviewing Dante's Theology*, ed. by Claire E. Honess and Matthew Treherne, 2 vols (Oxford: Lang, 2013), II, 89-155; Ronald L. Martinez, 'L'amoroso canto': Liturgy and Vernacular Lyric in Dante's *Purgatorio*', *Dante Studies*, 127 (2009), 93-

127; Erminia Ardissino, *Tempo liturgico e tempo storico nella 'Commedia' di Dante* (Vatican City: Libreria editrice Vaticana, 2009); John C. Barnes, 'Vestiges of the Liturgy in Dante's Verse', in *Dante and the Middle Ages: Literary and Historical Essays*, ed. by John C. Barnes and Cormac Ó. Cuilleanáin (Dublin: Irish Academic Press, 1995), pp. 231-69; Louis M. La Favia, "'...Chè quivi per canti...'" (*Purg.*, XII, 113): Dante's Programmatic Use of Psalms and Hymns in the *Purgatorio*', *Studies in Iconography*, 10 (1984-86), 53-65; Andrew McCracken, 'In Omnibus Viis Tuis: Compline in the Valley of the Rulers (*Purg.* VII-VIII)', *Dante Studies*, 111 (1993), 119-129; Ezio Raimondi, 'Canto I', in *Lectura Dantis Scaligera: Purgatorio* (Florence: Le Monnier, 1971), pp. 3-37 (pp. 6-13).

⁵ Martinez, 'The Poetics of Advent Liturgies', p. 279.

⁶ Treherne, 'La *Commedia* di Dante e l'immaginario liturgico', pp. 11-30. This article focuses on the various senses of time in the liturgies of Ante-Purgatory, Purgatory and the Earthly Paradise as expressions of the relationship – in its many manifestations – between human beings and God.

⁷ Margot Fassler, 'Representations of Time in *Ordo representacionis Ade*', *Yale French Studies*, Special issue, *Contexts: Style and Values in Medieval Art and Literature*, (1991), 97-113 (citation from p. 100); Margot Fassler, 'The Liturgical Framework of Time and the Representation of History', in *Representing History, 900-1300: Art, Music, History*, ed. by Robert A. Maxwell (University Park, PA: Pennsylvania State University Press, 2010), pp. 149-71; Margot Fassler, 'Liturgy and Sacred History in the Twelfth-Century Tympana at Chartres', *The Art Bulletin*, 75 (1993), 499-520.

⁸ Quotations from the *Commedia* are taken from Dante Alighieri, *Commedia*, ed. by Anna Maria Chiavacci Leonardi, 3 vols (Milan: Mondadori, 1991-97).

⁹ Tucker, 'In exitu Israel', pp. 43-61.

¹⁰ Albert E. Wingell, 'Dante, St. Augustine, and Astronomy', *Quaderni d'italianistica*, 2 (1981), 123-42 (pp. 123-26). Wingell argues that as Psalm 113 is now sung at dawn rather than at evening it marks the elision of evening into the new day, an Augustinian *pax sine vespera*. In the Hebrew Bible, Psalm 113 is split into Psalms 114 and 115.

¹¹ On Vespers in general and Easter Sunday Vespers in particular, see Andrew Hughes, *Medieval Manuscripts for Mass and Office: A Guide to their Organization and Terminology* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1982), pp. 68-74, 251-53, 268.

¹² On ordinals in general, see Edward Foley, 'The 'Libri Ordinarii': An Introduction', *Ephemerides Liturgicae*, 102 (1988), 129-37; and Aimé-Georges Martimort, *Les 'ordines', les ordinaires et les cérémoniaux*, *Typologie des sources du Moyen Age occidental*, 56 (Turnhout: Brepols, 1991), pp. 51-85.

¹³ Edition of the *Ritus in ecclesia servandi* (Florence, Biblioteca Riccardiana, 3005) in Franklin Toker, *On Holy Ground: Liturgy, Architecture and Urbanism in the Cathedral and the Streets of Medieval Florence* (Turnhout: Brepols, 2009), pp. 157-264. Edition of the *Mores et consuetudines canonice Florentine* (Florence, Archivio dell'Opera di Santa Maria del Fiore, I.3.8) in *ibid.*, pp. 265-84; first edition of the *Mores: Mores et consuetudines ecclesiae florentinae*, ed. by Domenico Moreni (Florence, 1794).

¹⁴ See Toker, *On Holy Ground*, pp. 9-156 (on the *Ritus* and *Mores* as most probably used throughout the thirteenth century, pp. 30-31); Marica S. Tacconi, *Cathedral and Civic Ritual in Late Medieval and Renaissance Florence: The Service Books of Santa*

Maria del Fiore (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2005), pp. 79-80, 94-135; Giulio Cattin, 'Novità dalla cattedrale di Firenze: Polifonia, tropi e sequenze nella seconda metà del XII secolo', *Musica e storia*, 6 (1998), 7-36. Francesco Ciabattini, *Dante's Journey to Polyphony*, pp. 24-27, uses Cattin's work on the *Ritus* as evidence for Dante's exposure to polyphonic music, but does not himself draw on the *Ritus* for other insights into the liturgical culture of Dante's Florence.

¹⁵ 'Postea dicat sacerdos *Dominus vobiscum* et or. que intitulatur *Ad fontem*. [...] Deinde *Benedicamus domino alleluia* sollemniter dicatur', *Ritus in ecclesia servandi*, lines 1643-46. ['Then let the priest sing *Dominus vobiscum* and the collect entitled *Ad fontem*. [...] Then let the *Benedicamus domino alleluia* be sung.']. Translations from Latin texts are mine.

¹⁶ It is not clear from the *Ritus* whether Psalm 113 was begun during the procession or after the procession had arrived at the font. In the latter case psalm and procession still remain closely linked, for the psalm's antiphon was sung during the procession and the psalm in the part of the ceremony that concluded the procession – the station at the font.

¹⁷ *Ordo officiorum ecclesiae Senensis ab Oderico eiusdem ecclesiae canonico anno MCCXIII compositus*, ed. by Giovanni Crisostomo Trombelli (Bologna: Longhi, 1766), cap. 200. On this ordinal (compiled 1215, despite Trombelli's title), see Kees van der Ploeg, *Art, Architecture and Liturgy: Siena Cathedral in the Middle Ages* (Groningen: Forsten, 1993), pp. 121-58; Frank A. D'Accone, *The Civic Muse: Music and Musicians in Siena during the Middle Ages and the Renaissance* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1997), pp. 51-8, 63-102, 110-17.

¹⁸ 'Mox Cantor dicat Antiph. *Crucifixum in Carne*, & cum Organo, & cum ea vadunt ad Fontes, vexillo cum Cruce praecedente. Cum autem pervenerint ad Fontes dicitur Antiph. *Pax vobis: Ego*. Psalm. *Laudate pueri*. Psalm. *In exitu*. V. *Quoniam apud te est fons vitae*. Oratio Paschalis dicatur pro renatis', *Ordo officiorum ecclesiae Senensis*, cap. 200. ['Then let the cantor sing the antiphon *Crucifixum in Carne*, accompanied by another voice in simple polyphony, and as it is sung they [clergy and people] process to the font, with the cross at the head of the procession. When they reach the font, the antiphon *Pax vobis: Ego*, the psalm *Laudate pueri*, the psalm *In exitu*, and the versicle *Quoniam apud te est fons vitae* are sung. Let the paschal collect be sung for the newly baptized.'] 'cum Cereis ardentibus praecedente ac praevio Crucis vexillo', cap. 201. ['with burning candles and the banner of the Cross leading the way.']

¹⁹ Pistoia, Biblioteca Capitolare, C 114: *Ordo officiorum Ecclesiae Pistoriensis* (second quarter thirteenth century), f. 27r.

My transcription (abbreviations expanded, italics and some punctuation added) from facsimile available at

<http://www.archiviocapitolaredipistoia.it/_ordo_officiorum_ecclesiae_pistoriensis_pt_ac_c114-idm306.php> [accessed 24 February 2015]. A late thirteenth/early fourteenth-century version (Pistoia, Biblioteca Capitolare, C 102) has the same instructions, f. 29r (available at

<http://www.archiviocapitolaredipistoia.it/_ordo_officiorum_ecclesiae_pistoriensis_pt_ac_c102-idm305.php> [accessed 24 February 2015]). On the Pistoia ordinals, see Giulio Cattin, '“Secundare” e “succinere”: Polifonia a Padova e Pistoia nel Duecento', *Musica e storia*, 3 (1995), 41-120 (pp. 63-89). The final Tuscan ordinal I have consulted is a late thirteenth-century one from the cathedral of Lucca. Here the Easter Sunday Vespers procession had a station at the church of Santa Reparata before

moving on to the Baptistry. Psalms 112 and 113 were sung during the first part of the procession. This ordinal (Lucca, Biblioteca Capitolare, 608) has not been published, but a summary is available in Martino Giusti, 'L' *Ordo officiorum* della cattedrale di Lucca', in *Miscellanea Giovanni Mercati*, 6 vols (Vatican City: Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, 1946), II, 523-66 (on Easter Vespers, pp. 538-9). In the Roman use, Psalm 113 was sung in the Office for the Dead as the deceased was carried to the church or cemetery, see Martinez, 'Dante and the Poem of the Liturgy', pp. 149-52.

²⁰ For a study that compares all the Tuscan ordinals cited here, see Benjamin Brand, *Holy Treasure and Sacred Song: Relic Cults and their Liturgies in Medieval Tuscany* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2014), pp. 116-23.

²¹ *Il "Liber Ordinarius" della Chiesa padovana: Padova, Biblioteca Capitolare, ms. E 57, sec. XIII*, ed. by Giulio Cattin and Anna Vildera, with Antonio Lovato and Andrea Tilatti, 2 vols (Padua: Istituto per la storia ecclesiastica padovana, 2002), cap. 127, (I, p. 130). On this ordinal, see the essays contained in volume I of this edition and Cattin, "Secundare' e 'succinere'", pp. 46-62, 86-89. As in Florence and Siena, the procession from Cathedral to Baptistry was held at Vespers throughout Easter Week.

²² 'Sane, descendimus processionaliter ad fontes cum cereo per totam ebdomadam cantantes canticum exultationis, et populus sequitur, uidelicet uiri per se et mulieres per se [...]. Et tunc circa fontes cantantur psalmi: *Laudate pueri* [...] et *In exitu Israel de Egypto*', William Durand, *Guillelmi Duranti Rationale divinorum officiorum*, ed. by Anselme Davril and Timothy M. Thibodeau, Corpus Christianorum, Continuatio Mediaevalis, 140, 140A, 140B (Turnhout: Brepols, 1995-2000), VI, 89, 10. ['Certainly, each day in [Easter] week we process with candles to the font singing a song of exultation and the people follow, that is, the men all together and the women all together [...]. And then at the font the psalms *Laudate pueri* [...] and *In exitu Israel de Egypto* are sung.']

²³ The convergence of multiple temporalities is, of course, not exclusive to the Vespers procession, but found throughout the liturgy; see footnote 7. Durand's discussion here is just one instance of the complexities of the senses of time contained in liturgy.

²⁴ The Sienese ordinal cited earlier also offers liturgical commentary, similarly glossing the Easter Vespers procession as a commemoration of the crossing of the Red Sea (as well as of the Exodus crossing of the Jordan and the conversion of Babylon): 'vel quod ad Processionem fontium per septem dies solemniter imus, ad memoriam reducimus, transitum Israel per Mare Rubrum', *Ordo officiorum ecclesiae Senensis*, cap. 201. ['Or we go in solemn procession to the font throughout the week to call to remembrance Israel's crossing of the Red Sea.']

²⁵ See, e.g., the Introduction to Robin Kirkpatrick's translation of the *Purgatorio* (London: Penguin, 2007), esp. pp. xix-xx, xxvii-xxviii, xlviii-li.

²⁶ On Dante's neologisms, see, e.g., Brenda Deen Schildgen, 'Dante's Neologisms in the *Paradiso* and the Latin Rhetorical Tradition', *Dante Studies*, 107 (1989), 101-19.

²⁷ Casella's song lies beyond the scope of this essay. I only note that clearly there is a chorus-solo contrast between the singing of *In exitu Israel* and of *Amor che ne la mente mi ragiona*, but I would not extend these reflections on community to argue that the problem with Casella's performance is that it is a solo. Solo vs choral is not necessarily the same as individualistic vs communal, for a collective dynamic can be created through solo song. Instead of being fostered through attention to fellow singers, communal bonds can be strengthened through the shared reactions of the

listeners, as occurs with Casella's audience (note the polysyndeton of 'Lo mio maestro e io e quella gente' (115) and the 'noi', emphatically placed at the start of the next *terzina* (118)). This group, however, does not focus its shared attention properly, for the souls treat Casella's song as an end in itself ('Noi eravam tutti fissi e attenti / a le sue note', 118-19). On *Amor che ne la mente* being treated as an endpoint, see Charles S. Singleton, *Dante Studies 1: 'Commedia': Elements of Structure* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1954), pp. 24-29. For the contrasting opinion that the problem with Casella's song is that it is a solo, see Federico Schneider, 'Ancora su "Dante musicus": Musica e dramma nella *Commedia*', *Studi medievali e moderni*, 14.2 (2010), 5-24 (p. 19). For a recent analysis of Casella's performance, see Paolo De Ventura, 'Dante e Casella: Allusione e performance', *Dante: Rivista Internazionale di Studi su Dante Alighieri*, 9 (2012), 43-56.

²⁸ Hannah C. Wojciehowski and Vittorio Gallese, 'How Stories Make Us Feel: Toward an Embodied Narratology', *California Italian Studies*, 2 (2011), <<http://escholarship.org/uc/item/3jg726c2>> [accessed 1 March 2015]. Also on embodied simulation, see Massimo Ammaniti and Vittorio Gallese, *The Birth of Intersubjectivity: Psychodynamics, Neurobiology, and the Self* (New York: Norton, 2014), pp. 10-20. At the conference, 'Visualising Posture in Dante's *Comedy*: History, Theory, Practice', held at the University of Cambridge, 12-13 September 2014, scholars explored various possibilities for embodied simulation in the *Commedia*. On embodied simulation as a response to the gestures enacted in Ante-Purgatory, see Heather Webb, *Dante's Persons: An Ethics of the Transhuman* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2016, forthcoming), chapter 2.

²⁹ See Vittorio Montemaggi, 'In Unknowability as Love: The Theology of Dante's *Commedia*', in *Dante's 'Commedia': Theology as Poetry*, pp. 60-94, for attentiveness to others as fundamental in defining one's own personhood and one's understanding of truth. On processions as expressing and creating a sense of community, see C. Clifford Flanigan, 'The Moving Subject: Medieval Liturgical Processions in Semiotic and Cultural Perspective', in *Moving Subjects: Processional Performance in the Middle Ages and the Renaissance*, ed. by Kathleen Ashley and Wim Hüsken, (Amsterdam: Rodopi, 2001), pp. 35-51. On the centrality of processions, liturgical and civic, in medieval culture, see, e.g., Kathleen Ashley, 'Introduction: The Moving Subjects of Processional Performance', in *Moving Subjects*, pp. 7-34 (pp. 7-12); and Margot Fassler, 'Adventus at Chartres: Ritual Models for Major Processions', in *Ceremonial Culture in Pre-Modern Europe*, ed. by Nicholas Howe (Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 2007), pp. 13-62.

³⁰ Edward Muir, 'The Eye of the Procession: Ritual Ways of Seeing in the Renaissance', in *Ceremonial Culture*, pp. 129-53 (p. 132). On the liminality of processions, see also the essays collected in *Moving Subjects*.

³¹ Durand, *Rationale*, VI, 89, 11; *Ordo officiorum ecclesiae Senensis*, cap. 201.

³² Robin Kirkpatrick, *Dante's 'Paradiso' and the Limitations of Modern Criticism: A Study of Style and Poetic Theory* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1978), pp. 108-14; Chiavacci Leonardi, gloss on *Par.*, II. 10-11.

³³ On the sea voyage topos, see Ernst Robert Curtius, *European Literature and the Latin Middle Ages*, trans. by Willard R. Trask (New York: Pantheon, 1953), pp. 128-30. Paola Allegretti, 'Argo: "Dietro al mio legno che cantando varca" (*Par.* II 3)', *Studi Danteschi*, 69 (2004), 185-209 (pp. 195-203), links the singing ship of *Paradiso* II to versions of the Argo myth in which the Argo could speak.

³⁴ On the rich network of associations of the term *legno*, see Lodovico Cardellino, ‘Dante ha strutturato il ‘Paradiso’ in base ai ‘segni’ di Giovanni. Il ‘principio’ dei segni: le nozze di Cana e le suore tratte dal convento al matrimonio’, in his *Dante e la Bibbia* (Brescia: Sardini, 2007), pp. 119-37.

³⁵ On readers as performers of the psalms in another poetic genre, see Annie Sutherland, ‘Performing the Penitential Psalms in the Middle Ages’, in *Aspects of the Performative in Medieval Culture*, ed. by Manuele Gragnolati and Almut Suerbaum (Berlin: De Gruyter, 2010), pp. 15-37 (esp. pp. 32-37). This article explores medieval English paraphrases of the Penitential Psalms and the need for the reader to perform the psalms, both by voicing their words and by living out their precepts.

³⁶ Montemaggi, ‘In Unknowability’, pp. 77-82.

³⁷ On the manifold interactions between liturgy (in these examples, specifically processions) and architectural space, see, e.g., Margot E. Fassler, *The Virgin of Chartres: Making History through Liturgy and the Arts* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2010), pp. 242-81; Carolyn Marino Malone, ‘Interprétation des pratiques liturgiques à Saint-Bénigne de Dijon d’après ses coutumiers d’inspiration clunisienne’, in *From Dead of Night to End of Day: The Medieval Customs of Cluny*, ed. by Susan Boynton and Isabelle Cochelin (Turnhout: Brepols, 2005), pp. 221-50; Kristina Krüger, ‘Monastic Customs and Liturgy in the Light of the Architectural Evidence: A Case Study on Processions (Eleventh-Twelfth Centuries)’, in *ibid.*, pp. 191-220.

³⁸ The notion that song marks out the rhythm of the souls’ processional journey finds reinforcement in Margot Fassler’s work on liturgy, song and space. She has contextualized many chants in the processions and spaces within which they were sung and writes that music ‘defined the motion, [the] points of destination and return’ of the processions in which it was performed; *The Virgin of Chartres*, p. 249.

³⁹ Citations from the Bible are taken from the Vulgate and translations from the Douay/Rheims edition.

⁴⁰ Robert Durling and Ronald Martinez note this in their edition, gloss on *Purg.*, II. 46-48.

⁴¹ On this *Gloria* as imperfect doxology and anticipation of paradisiacal praise (along with other instances of doxology in *Purgatorio*, though *In exitu Israel* is not mentioned) and on doxology as a constitutive element of personhood in *Paradiso*, see Treherne, ‘Liturgical Personhood’, pp. 137-58.

⁴² On the traditional understanding of the *Gloria* of the Mass as a *hymnus angelicus*, see Gunilla Iversen, *Laus angelica: Poetry in the Medieval Mass*, ed. by Jane Flynn, trans. by William Flynn (Turnhout: Brepols, 2010), pp. 93-125.

⁴³ Catherine Pickstock, ‘Liturgy, Art and Politics’, *Modern Theology*, 16 (2000), 159-180 (p. 161).

⁴⁴ A hapax in the *Commedia* and also a rare term in medieval Italian vernacular literature; the database of the *Tesoro della Lingua Italiana delle Origini (Corpus TLIO)* records only one use before the *Commedia*: ‘Onni virtù in lei pasce e congaude, / e catuna di lei riceve aiuto’, Guittone d’Arezzo, sonetto 192, ll. 9-10, in *Le rime di Guittone d’Arezzo*, ed. by Francesco Egidi (Bari: Laterza, 1940). See <<http://tlioweb.ovi.cnr.it/>> [accessed 18 August 2015].